

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2 N 3827

DATE: 2006-01-11

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2
Coded Character Sets
Secretariat: **Japan (JISC)**

DOC. TYPE	Procedural Documentation						
TITLE	Revised Annex N, The Normative Referencing of Specifications of other than International Standards in JTC 1 International Standards - Guidelines for JTC 1 SCs [JTC 1 N 8024]						
SOURCE	JTC 1 Secretariat						
PROJECT							
STATUS	As per JTC 1 Banff resolution 16, JTC 1 approved document JTC 1 N 8024 (Banff 001A-C) as a replacement for the current Annex N. Further, JTC 1 is asking SC 2 to provide the ARO template for Unicode. The Unicode Consortium is asked to fill out the ARO template and send it to SC 2.						
ACTION ID	ACT						
DUE DATE							
DISTRIBUTION	P, O and L Members of ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2 ; ISO/IEC JTC 1 Secretariat; ISO/IEC ITTF						
ACCESS LEVEL	Open						
ISSUE NO.	230						
FILE	<table border="1"><tr><td>NAME</td><td>02n3827.pdf</td></tr><tr><td>SIZE (KB)</td><td></td></tr><tr><td>PAGES</td><td>13</td></tr></table>	NAME	02n3827.pdf	SIZE (KB)		PAGES	13
NAME	02n3827.pdf						
SIZE (KB)							
PAGES	13						

Secretariat ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2 - IPSJ/ITSCJ *(Information Processing Society of Japan/Information Technology Standards Commission of Japan) Room 308-3, Kikai-Shinko-Kaikan Bldg., 3-5-8, Shiba-Koen, Minato-ku, Tokyo 105-0011 Japan *Standard Organization Accredited by JISC
Telephone: +81-3-3431-2808; Facsimile: +81-3-3431-6493; E-mail: kimura@itscj.ipsj.or.jp

ISO/IEC JTC 1 Information Technology

Document Type: procedural documentation

Document Title: Revised Annex N, The Normative Referencing of Specifications other than International Standards in JTC 1 International Standards - Guidelines for JTC 1 SCs

Document Source: JTC 1 Secretariat

Project Number:

Document Status: **As per JTC 1 Banff resolution 16**, JTC 1 approves document **JTC 1 N 8024 (Banff 001A-C)** as a replacement for the current Annex N, *The Normative Referencing of Specifications other than International Standards in JTC 1 International Standards - Guidelines for JTC 1 SCs*, of the JTC 1 Directives. The JTC 1 Secretariat will implement this change in the JTC 1 Directives Edition 5 (.doc, .pdf and .html versions) shortly and will advise JTC 1 National Bodies and Subcommittees when the change has been completed.

With the approval of the revised Annex N, JTC 1 encourages National Bodies and Subcommittees to collaborate on rapidly progressing a first set of Approved RS Originator Organization (AROs) by providing the information required by the new ARO template form for those organizations which have specifications which many SCs have referenced. JTC 1 acknowledges the offers of PAS Mentors to assist the SCs in providing the ARO templates for the following organizations:

- IETF – (SC 36 to prepare template)
- IEEE – (SC 7 to prepare template)
- W3C – (SC 6 to prepare template)
- OASIS – (JTC 1 to prepare template)
- SMPTE – (SC 29 to prepare template)
- Unicode – (SC 2 to prepare template)

Action ID: FYI

Due Date:

No. of Pages:

Replaces:

Annex N The Normative Referencing of Specifications other than International Standards in JTC 1 International Standards - Guidelines for JTC 1 SCs

N1 Purpose and scope of this Guide

ISO/IEC JTC 1 has defined and implemented a policy that encourages and assists the transposition of certain technical specifications from sources outside JTC 1 into international standards. Annex M "The Transposition of Publicly Available Specifications (PAS) into International Standards - A Management Guide" describes in detail this transposition process.

JTC 1 also recognises that there may be situations where it is appropriate to reference a specification without performing the transposition process as described in Annex M. This situation may apply in a number of cases. JTC 1 assumes that the procedures and conditions for referencing depend on the process and the kind of international standard (IS) in which the reference will be established.

One of the cases is described in this document, namely where an International Standard (IS) is developed by a JTC 1 Subcommittee, using the five stage process. Other cases will be considered later.

JTC 1 re-emphasises its preference for transposition into international standards as the approach to include material from outside JTC 1. However, if the referencing approach is chosen, it is necessary to establish such references in international standards in a consistent way which ensures the quality of international standards established by JTC 1 as well as the proper treatment of IPR issues. Therefore, a process has to be defined by JTC 1 for the establishment of references to documents other than from ISO, IEC or ITU.

JTC 1 SCs may, in the course of their work, find it appropriate to incorporate specifications into an emerging IS by way of reference. The need for such action, the selection of the appropriate specification, and the evaluation of the proposed Referenced Specification (RS) itself are matters for the SC to determine. Any such SC decision will, however, be subject to JTC 1 National Body evaluation during the respective ballot.

JTC 1 SCs are reminded that, in accordance to Resolution 28 of the 11th JTC 1 Plenary Meeting in Seoul, Korea in 1999, "SCs and National Bodies are requested to pay particular attention to mechanisms that could be utilized to reduce the burden of the process on officers at the SC level. Examples can include reuse by on SC of prior written statements developed by another SC, or the use of appropriate statements from approved co-operative agreements between JTC 1 and another organization."

As no restrictions apply to making informative references (see ISO/IEC Directives Part 2), the scope of this document is limited to the normative referencing of a specification other than from ISO, IEC or ITU in an international standard.

These Guidelines provide insights to facilitate the SC consideration and subsequent incorporation of an RS into a JTC 1 IS. Since the consideration of a proposed RS may well involve more than purely technical considerations, it is deemed helpful to provide these Guidelines. The SC is asked to use this document to facilitate the process. As to IPR issues or

organisational matters, it is expected that the SC will contact the appropriate bodies (e.g. ITTF) to obtain the necessary information and that the SC will, if necessary, facilitate discussion between ISO/IEC and the RS Originator.

N2 JTC 1 approach to referencing other specifications

According to ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, referencing sources other than ISO, IEC, or ITU is a valid approach for making use of such specifications, provided JTC 1 deems it appropriate. While JTC 1 supports this approach, it has to maintain the quality of its work and the integrity of the standards development process. Therefore, it is necessary to establish some referencing rules that complement those of ISO/IEC. Though rules and guidelines are important, JTC 1 wishes them to be as straightforward as possible. This also takes account of the fact that the initiative for establishing references usually comes from the standards developing community within JTC 1. Further, minimal additional burden should be put on the originator of a specification being referenced.

N3 Terms for normative references to other specifications

The process of establishing normative references to documents other than from ISO, IEC or ITU is based on the ISO/IEC Directives and the JTC 1 Directives with the addition of the following terms:

- Referenced Specification (RS)

A specification from a source other than ISO, IEC, or ITU is called a Referenced Specification (RS) if it meets certain criteria (see N6) and has been balloted and accepted together with the FDIS at the JTC 1 National Body level as suitable for normative referencing in the resulting international standard (IS). An RS may be a part of a larger specification.

- RS Originator

The originator of an RS or a proposed RS is called an RS Originator.

In N7 there is a procedure whereby an organization may be designated as an approved RS Originator for all of its standards in order to simplify RS processing by SCs.

- Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO)

N4 Principles for referencing of specifications

N4.1 An RS shall be within the JTC 1 scope.

N4.2 Concerning conformity and interoperability, ISs containing normative references to other specifications have to follow the same requirements and rules as for other JTC 1 standards as defined in the JTC 1 Directives.

N4.3 When the referencing specification (CD or FDIS) is submitted for ballot it shall either be accompanied by a Referencing Explanatory Report (RER) which has been generated by the SC wishing to incorporate the RS in a target IS or the SC will ensure that the organization creating the reference specification has previously met such organizational requirements so as to be listed as an Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO).

N4.4 The RER shall contain the following elements:

N4.4.1 a justification for the referencing which shall also address the following aspects:

- relationship of the proposed RS to existing or emerging international standards (and regional or other standards as appropriate) and when the RS is competing with or complementing an existing or emerging international standard, the rationale for the referencing;
- the degree of market acceptance of the proposed RS; and
- the rationale as to why the transposition of the proposed RS into an IS is inappropriate or impractical,

N4.4.2 statements that address the criteria as detailed in N6.

N4.4.3 a copy of the normative referencing policy of the RS Originator (where one exists).

N4.5 The material submitted for ballot shall either include a copy of the proposed RS or a means by which National Bodies may readily access the material (e.g., ISBN or URL) and meet the availability requirements of N6.3.1.3. If the referenced material has been made available to JTC 1 member bodies previously as an N numbered document, it is acceptable, instead, to refer to this document.

N4.6 For actual referencing, the rules of the ISO/IEC Directives apply. In particular, any reference shall be specific and indicate the publication date and/or version number as appropriate.

N4.7 If an RS, in turn, contains a normative reference to a specification other than an international standard or ARO standard, the information required by an RER shall normally be provided for each additional reference. The exception to this requirement is when the level of detail involved would be so time-consuming to assemble, and difficult to interpret, that its collection would be counter-productive. In this case, the SC shall explain the situation in a way that will enable National Bodies to make an informed assessment of the references that are being made. The responsible SC is expected to thoroughly process all nested references.

N5 Description of the process for JTC 1 Subcommittee use

N5.1 Announcement of intent to make reference

The intention to make a normative reference to a specification other than an international standard should be stated in the New Work Item Proposal (NP) if the requirement is known at that time; otherwise, the intent should be communicated to JTC 1 National Bodies as soon as consensus on the need is reached in the SC.

N5.2 Preparation of the Referencing Explanatory Report

It is the obligation of the JTC 1 Subcommittee which develops an IS containing normative references to specifications other than international standards, to either provide for each proposed RS a related RER or to ensure that the organization creating the reference specification has previously met such organizational requirements so as to be listed as an Approved Reference Organization. The elements of this Report are described in clause 4.4 above. In order to avoid any undue delay in the standard ratification process and to avoid the wasting of development resources, the production of a RER or the confirmation of the organization as an Approved RS Originator Organization should commence as soon as the standard developing Subcommittee has determined the need to establish a normative reference.

N5.3 Availability of the Referencing Explanatory Report

The RER, or confirmation of the organization as an ARO, shall be made available to JTC 1 and its National Bodies as early as possible and appropriate. The latest date for the availability of the Report or ARO status is the submission of

the first CD. The RER/ARO confirmation shall also accompany any subsequent CD and FDIS ballot.

N5.4 Ballot

The material submitted for ballot (CD and FDIS) shall include the RER/ARO confirmation together with a copy of the proposed RS. If the Report or the proposed RS have already been provided earlier, it is acceptable to give, instead, a reference to the earlier submission and a statement verifying that no changes have occurred in the meantime.

In the case of a CD ballot, JTC 1 National Bodies are invited to independently submit their comments on the RER/ARO confirmation by the time the CD ballot closes, for review by the relevant SC.

Comments and votes are handled in the usual way. The RS Originator may be invited to attend the appropriate part of any resolution meeting held.

N5.5 Publication of the standard

No particular provisions regarding publication apply where an IS contains a reference to an RS. The source of the RS may be different from that of an IS, and it is not required that the text of the RS should be published, or distributed, with the referencing standard.

N5.6 Maintenance

It is expected that JTC 1 will evaluate the consequences of any change to the RS subsequent to its inclusion as a reference in a JTC 1 standard, for appropriate action (e.g. revision, exclusion). At every maintenance interval the RER and all RSs shall be evaluated for their continued availability and relevance. If required (see N3), new RERs may be generated for RSs not presently covered by an RER or sourced from an ARO.

N5.7 Documentation requirements

Further to the requirements in the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, all RSs to which a normative reference is made, should be identified in a subclause of clause 2 of the IS. This subclause should start with the following text:

All references in this subclause were correct at the time of approval of this International Standard. The provisions of the referenced specifications, as identified in this subclause, are valid within the context of this IS. The reference to a specification within this IS does not give it any further status within ISO/IEC; in particular, it does not give the referenced specification the status of an International Standard.

N6 Evaluation of a proposed RS

N6.1 Introduction

JTC 1 has established criteria which serve as a basis for the judgment as to whether a particular specification can be accepted as a normative reference in an international standard. This judgment initially occurs at JTC 1 Subcommittee level when a decision to establish a normative reference is made, and later at NB level during the CD or FDIS ballot.

JTC 1 considers that the primary benefit of these criteria is guidance for consistent evaluation rather than an absolute pass/fail mechanism. There is a wide variety of specifications available for consideration as well as a wide variety of needs within the JTC 1 community. An absolute pass/fail mechanism over such a wide variety of material is unlikely. What is needed throughout this process is flexibility and good judgment on the part of all concerned. Rather than

provide quantitative measures to evaluate acceptability of a proposed RS on a pass/ fail basis, the criteria set forth the key topics for consideration and measures for evaluating them in terms of the scope, depth, and thoroughness with which the criteria topics have been considered.

N6.2 Supplementary elements

It is intended that the questions asked under each Criteria Category are to be viewed as examples of ways in which the basic criteria sub-category might be evaluated. There may well be other responses to unasked questions that best describe how well a given proposed RS meets, for example, an acceptable level of "Quality". In general, the more complete the RER and its accompanying documents, the easier it will be for JTC 1 National Bodies to evaluate an international standard making a normative reference to an RS.

N6.3 Criteria

N6.3.1 Co-operative stance

The SC shall notify the RS Originator of the intent to reference the RS and provide the RS Originator with a copy of the RER. The SC is encouraged to, where possible, work with the RS Originator to ensure the accuracy of all elements of the RER. The RS Originator shall be provided the opportunity, within a reasonable period of time, to object to the reference to the RS. If the RS Originator notifies the SC that it objects to such a reference the SC must not include the reference to the RS.

The RER There shall be contain comprehensive statements covering the following categories and topics:

N6.3.1.1 Ongoing maintenance:

If the RS Originator is not available to maintain the RS, who is responsible for maintenance of the RS if and when the need arises?

N6.3.1.2 Changes

What is the flexibility of the RS Originator to apply changes to the RS if so requested during the process of balloting the referencing standard?

N6.3.1.3 Availability of the referenced specification

What is the status of public availability of the RS on fair, reasonable and nondiscriminatory terms and conditions? Standards that are Publicly Available to implementers, evaluators and other interested parties for as long as the IS that references them is an active document are those which:

- May be obtained from the source organization by any person (with or without payment) simply by quoting the reference number given in the IS to the source organization or typical supplier.
- Are available in one of the official ISO or IEC languages from a publicly accessible source.
- Are available without contractual limitations relating to its evaluation (other than limitations reasonably intended to restrict duplication and redistribution) and without substantive contractual limits on implementation of the referenced material or the IS as a condition of obtaining access to the referenced material.

N6.3.2 Intellectual property rights

It is the SC's responsibility to ensure that statements in response to N6.3.2.1 - N6.3.2.3 are provided in the RER. The SC is encouraged to work with the RS Originator to ensure the accuracy of the statements on the items listed below.

N6.3.2.1 Patents:

What is the status of the RS Originator, or where appropriate, the policy governing the RS meeting the ISO/IEC policy on patent matters?

N6.3.2.2 Copyrights:

What copyrights exist, and what copyrights is the RS Originator willing to grant, throughout both the evaluation and the publication cycle?

N6.3.2.3 Trademark rights:

What trademarks apply to the RS and with what conditions?

N6.3.3 Quality

The SC shall establish that the proposed RS is of adequate quality, considering topics such as the length of the time the specification has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, and whether the specification is readily and widely available.

N7 An Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO)

N7.1 Confirmation as an Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO)

On the occasion that a particular RS Originator has already been referenced by a prior ISO/IEC JTC 1 IS (or TR) and documented in an RER, or in preparation for future referencing in an IS (or TR), the SC or any National Body may nominate the RS Originator to be confirmed as an ARO. In the absence of an objection from the candidate ARO, an ARO Overview Submission, describing the RS Originator's cooperative stance: the ongoing maintenance agreement, the application of changes, the availability of the referenced specifications, the position of the RS Originator on intellectual property, patent rights, copyrights, and trademark rights, and the overall qualification of all of its deliverables to meet the criteria specified herein for RSs, shall be issued for a 3 month ballot by JTC 1 for approval of that organization as an ARO. Upon ballot approval, the RS Originator shall be added to a list of AROs in good standing. Such a list of Approved RS Originator Organizations will be maintained by the JTC 1 Secretariat and published on the JTC 1 website.

An SC may reference an ARO as a previously submitted and Approved RS Originator Organization.

N7.2 Change of status for an Approved RS Originator Organization

An SC or National Body shall notify JTC 1 if it becomes aware that the content of an ARO's Overview Submission is no longer accurate. Furthermore, prior to referencing an ARO in an FDIS or amended IS, the SC must confirm that all content as contained in the documented Overview Submission is accurate and current.

Should an ARO's procedures vary in a non-essential manner from the ~~RS~~ ARO Overview on file, the submitting SC or sponsoring NB, in cooperation with the ARO, shall provide an updated ARO Overview, no later than submission of the FDIS/FDAM ballot to JTC 1. The JTC 1 Secretariat is to notify all other affected SCs of a change in the ARO's RER for

their consideration. On the occasion that an ARO's policies change in a substantial manner (e.g., such that they are no longer aligned with ISO/IEC Directives and Policies), the submitting SC or NB shall request reconfirmation with JTC 1 of the organization's status as an ARO. Should reconfirmation fail, the ARO will be removed from the JTC 1 ARO listing and the affected SCs shall be notified to take necessary action to address all pending referenced specifications from that ARO and the ARO will be removed from the JTC 1 approved listing.

Banff 001B
Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO) Template

Sponsor (SC or NB) _____

Date of Application _____

ARO Candidate Name _____

Note: URLs to specific portions of an organization's web site are acceptable answers throughout this document.

1. General Information about the ARO Candidate

This section shall address the following:

- A) A Brief History of the ARO Candidate
- B) The contact information and organizational structure of the ARO candidate.
- C) The scope of standardization work within the ARO Candidate.

2. Co-operative stance

This section shall address the following:

- A) Has the ARO candidate been notified that JTC1 is preparing to consider the organization as an ARO?
- B) Has the ARO candidate indicated any reluctance for JTC1 to consider the organization as an ARO.

2.1 Ongoing maintenance:

This section should address the following:

- A) What arrangements have been made for the ongoing maintenance of the documents created by the ARO that are normatively referenced by JTC 1 standards?
- B) Has consideration been given to maintenance of the ARO candidate's standards if the ARO ceases operation?

2.2 Changes

This section should address the following:

- A) What is the flexibility of the ARO candidate to apply changes to an RS if so requested during the process of balloting a referencing standard?

2.3 Availability of the referenced specification

This section should address the following:

- A) What is the status of public availability¹ of the ARO candidate's specifications?
- B) What is the URL or address where the ARO's specifications may be acquired?

3 Intellectual property rights

This section should address the following:

- A) Is the IPR policy of the ARO candidate publicly available or attached to this application?

¹ Standards that are Publicly Available to implementers, evaluators and other interested parties for as long as the IS that references them is an active document are those which:

- May be obtained from the source organization by any person (with or without payment) simply by quoting the reference number given in the IS to the source organization or typical supplier.
- Are available in one of the official ISO and IEC languages from a publicly accessible source.
- Are available without contractual limitations relating to its evaluation (other than limitations reasonably intended to restrict duplication and redistribution) and without substantive contractual limits on implementation of the referenced material or the IS as a condition of obtaining access to the referenced material.

3.1 Patents:

This section should address the following:

- A) Does the ARO candidate meet the ISO/IEC policy on patent matters?
 - i) If not, what difference or differences should JTC 1 be aware of?

3.2 Copyrights:

This section should address the following:

- A) What copyrights exist, and what copyrights is the ARO candidate willing to grant, throughout both the evaluation and the publication cycle, of specifications developed by the ARO candidate?
- B) Will the ARO candidate allow the text of the RS to be attached to a JTC 1 ballot as part of the ballot package for the referencing specification?

3.3 Trademark rights:

This section should address the following:

- A) What trademarks apply to the ARO candidate's specifications and with what conditions?

4 Quality

This section should address the following:

- A) Has the sponsor (SC or NB) established that the ARO candidate's specifications are of adequate quality, considering topics such as the length of the time the organization and its specifications have existed, whether products have been implemented using the ARO candidate's specifications, whether conformance requirements are clear, and whether the specifications are readily and widely available.

5 Review

- A) Has the sponsor reviewed this application with an authorized representative of the ARO candidate?

Banff 001C
RS Referencing Explanatory Report (RER) Template

SC _____

Date _____

RS Originator _____

RS Name and Identifier _____

Note: URLs to specific portions of an organization's web site are acceptable answers throughout this document.

1. Justification Statement

This section shall address the following:

- A) What is the relationship of the proposed RS to existing or emerging international standards (and regional or other standards as appropriate)
- B) If the RS is competing with or complementing an existing or emerging international standard, what is the rationale for referencing the RS?
- B) What is the degree of market acceptance of the proposed RS?
- C) Why (or to what degree) is the transposition of the proposed RS into an IS inappropriate or impractical?

2. Co-operative stance

This section shall address the following:

- A) Has the RS Originator been notified that JTC1 is preparing to normatively reference the RS?
- B) Has the SC reviewed this RER with an authorized representative of the RS Originator?
- C) Has the RS Originator indicated any reluctance for JTC1 to reference the RS?.

2.1 Ongoing maintenance:

This section should address the following:

- A) What arrangements have been made for the ongoing maintenance of the RS?
- B) Has consideration been given to maintenance of the RS if the RS Originator ceases operation? If so, what plans are in place to address this?

2.2 Changes

This section should address the following:

- A) What is the flexibility of the RS Originator to apply changes to the RS if so requested during the process of balloting the referencing standard?

2.3 Availability of the referenced specification

This section should address the following:

- A) What is the status of public availability¹ of the RS on fair, reasonable and nondiscriminatory terms and conditions?
- B) What is the URL or address where the RS Originator's specifications may be acquired?

¹ Standards that are Publicly Available to implementers, evaluators and other interested parties for as long as the IS that references them is an active document are those which:

- May be obtained from the source organization by any person (with or without payment) simply by quoting the reference number given in the IS to the source organization or typical supplier.
- Are available in one of the official ISO and IEC languages from a publicly accessible source.
- Are available without contractual limitations relating to its evaluation (other than limitations reasonably intended to restrict duplication and redistribution) and without substantive contractual limits on implementation of the referenced material or the IS as a condition of obtaining access to the referenced material.

3. Intellectual property rights

This section should address the following:

- A) Is the IPR policy of the RS Originator publicly available or attached to this application?
- B) Has the RS Originator reviewed this application for accuracy?

3.1 Patents:

This section should address the following:

- A) Does the RS Originator meet the ISO/IEC policy on patent matters?
 - i) If not, what difference or differences should JTC 1 be aware of?

3.2 Copyrights:

This section should address the following:

- A) What copyrights exist, and what copyrights is the RS Originator willing to grant, throughout both the evaluation and the publication cycle?
- B) Will the RS Originator allow the text of the RS to be attached to a JTC 1 ballot as part of the ballot package for the referencing specification?

3.3 Trademark rights:

This section should address the following:

- A) What trademarks apply to the RS and with what conditions?

4. Quality

This section should address the following:

- A) Has the SC establish that the proposed RS is of adequate quality, considering topics such as the length of the time the specification has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, and whether the specification is readily and widely available?
- B) What is the current level of standardization as of the data of this RER?
 - Example: for IETF references, state what the level is - Best Current Practice, Proposed Standard , Draft Standard or Internet Standard